

Meeting	Corporate and Scrutiny Management Committee
Date	23 June 2014
Present	Councillors Galvin (Chair), Burton, Fraser, Horton, Jeffries, Potter, Runciman (Vice-Chair) and Steward
In attendance	Councillor Simpson-Laing (agenda items 1 to 4) Councillor Semlyen (agenda item 6)
Apologies	Councillor King

Part A - Matters Dealt With Under Delegated Powers

1. Declarations Of Interest

At this point in the meeting, Members were asked to declare any personal interests not included on the register of interests, any prejudicial interests or any disclosable pecuniary interest which they might have in respect of the business on the agenda. No additional interests were declared.

2. Minutes

Resolved: That the minutes of the last meeting of the Committee held on 12 May 2014 be approved and signed by the Chair as a correct record.

3. Public Participation

It was reported that there had been no registrations to speak at the meeting under the Council's Public Participation Scheme.

4. Attendance Of Deputy Leader

The Deputy Leader presented her report on her priorities and challenges for the forthcoming year.

Members raised a number of points to which the Deputy Leader provided the following information:

- The possibility of using palantypists to enable meetings to be streamed with captioning had been explored. However, there were a number of reasons why this would not be possible.
- Details were given of the consultation that had taken place in respect of the restoration programme for the Mansion House. The Deputy Leader was asked to consider further ways in which accessibility could be improved, including improving the position of the doorbell and improving the stair lift in the Guildhall. It was noted that, although not within the Deputy Leader's portfolio, the situation in respect of the stair lift would be considered as part of the Guildhall Project.
- Members stressed the importance of ensuring that, during the closure of the Mansion House, everything possible was done to maintain civic dignity, including the use of alternative venues as appropriate.
- In response to questions as to whether more could be done to engage Members in training and development, details were given of the planned training opportunities for this municipal year. In conjunction with the Workforce Development Unit, consideration was also being given to the synergies between Member training and officer training to identify further training opportunities. The development of E-Learning opportunities was also an area which could be further explored.
- Referring to the ongoing review of the Council's Constitution, Members stressed the importance of ensuring that, as part of the process, the proposed changes were considered by the Audit and Governance Committee.

The Cabinet Member was thanked for her report and attendance at the meeting.

Resolved: That the Deputy Leader's report be received and noted.

Reason: To update the Committee on ongoing work in this area and provide scrutiny of the portfolio.

5. Supporting Elderly People - Briefing On Key Issues For Potential Corporate Review

Consideration was given to a report which presented a briefing paper on the key issues for consideration by Members in developing 'Supporting Elderly People' as a potential theme for a corporate scrutiny review. Development of this theme had arisen from the annual work planning event held in May.

It was noted that, arising from York's Health and Wellbeing Strategy 2013-16 and the Joint Strategic Needs Assessment 2012 (JSNA), a scrutiny review on elderly people would support the first priority of the Assessment. Following a refresh of the JSNA a number of in depth studies were to be carried out, one of which would relate to the frail and elderly and this review may highlight any issues worthy for scrutiny review.

In line with their individual terms of reference a number of suggested areas for possible review had been set out for the four Overview and Scrutiny Committees in the report.

The Chair asked if Lead Officers had been asked for their input regarding the proposed corporate review. He was informed that the Lead Officers had been asked to contribute although it was not clear if all had responded.

Some Members expressed concern regarding the use of the word "elderly" and stated that this should be replaced with "older people".

Discussion took place regarding potential remits. Whilst it was agreed that it was for the committees themselves to determine their choice of topic, Members suggested that work regarding preventative or early intervention would be useful. Other suggestions included housing for older people, social isolation and perceptions of security/fear of crime.

Resolved: That a corporate scrutiny review be carried out on "Supporting Older People" and all Scrutiny Committees be asked to consider their suggested remits and undertake their reviews for report back to this Committee.

Reason: In order to ensure effective scrutiny of key Council priorities.

6. Request For Change Of Scrutiny Committee Terms Of Reference

[See also Part B minute]

Members considered a report which advised of requests made to amend the terms of reference of two Scrutiny Committees in order to address the balance of work between the Committees. Members' comments were also requested on a proposal for an inherent way of scrutiny working which was outcome based to enable the success of review recommendations to be more easily measured.

Proposed Change to Remits

Members considered the request to move the housing landlord and stock portfolio from the Economic and City Development Overview and Scrutiny Committee (ECDOSC) to the Community Safety Overview and Scrutiny Committee, whilst leaving ECDOSC with the housing strategy elements under the Local Plan. Members expressed their support for the request and commented that, as part of the wider ongoing review of scrutiny, consideration should be given to ensuring the name of the committee reflected its broader remit.

"Success Matrix" (or evidence and outcome based) Approach to Scrutiny

Councillor Semlyen had been invited to attend the meeting and gave details of her proposed approach to the way Council might wish to undertake its scrutiny reviews, so that it ensured that its recommendations were evidence and outcome based, as well as measurable.

Officers drew Members' attention to the Centre for Public Scrutiny's recommendations of good practice for delivering effective scrutiny recommendations, as outlined in paragraph 9 of the report. These guidelines were broadly in line with Councillor Semlyen's aims.

Members expressed their support for ensuring that measurable and evidence based targets were set, but felt it was important to recognise that some recommendations from scrutiny reviews would take time to embed and that the focus should not always be on short-term outcomes. Members also commented on

other ways in which scrutiny could be developed, including giving consideration as to whether the choice of scrutiny topics could be better linked to the corporate performance of the Council and encouraging Members to play a greater role in research. It was suggested that discussion take place with the Chairs and Vice-Chairs of scrutiny committees regarding these matters. It was also noted that the review of the Constitution would also consider issues in respect of scrutiny.

Resolved: That the cultural approach towards evidence and outcome based scrutiny reviews, outlined in paragraphs 8-11 of the report, be endorsed subject to any change being made in scrutiny procedure rules being considered by the Audit and Governance Committee.

Reason: To enable the work of Scrutiny Committees to progress efficiently and deliver effective outcomes.

7. Work Plan 2014/15

Consideration was given to the Committee's work plan for the 2014/15 municipal year.

Resolved: That the Committee's work plan for 2013/14 be received and noted.

Reason: To assist in the formulation of the Committee's work plan for the remainder of the municipal year.

Part B - Matters Referred To Council

8. Request For Change Of Scrutiny Committee Terms Of Reference

[See also Part A minute]

Further to Minute No. 6 above, under which Members considered a report seeking advice on amending the terms of reference of two Scrutiny Committees, Members discussed the benefits of these slight revisions whilst awaiting the outcome of the wider ongoing scrutiny review. It was then

Recommended: That Council approve the slight change to the remits of Economic and City Development and

Community Safety Committees, as detailed in paragraph 7 of the report, to redress the balance of responsibilities between the two.

Reason: To enable the work of Scrutiny Committees to progress efficiently and deliver effective outcomes.

Councillor J.Galvin, Chair
[The meeting started at 5.00 pm and finished at 6.10 pm].